

Malédiction ou bénédiction ? Ressources naturelles, développement humain et genre

Rafael Romeu
Systèmes DevTech

José Pineda
Université de la Colombie-Britannique

Motivation (i)

- L'énigme des ressources naturelles (RN)
 - On a accusé les RN de provoquer une croissance stagnante, une crise économique et politique
 - Mexique, Nigéria, Venezuela
 - Mais une forte croissance pour de nombreux pays
 - Australie, Botswana, Norvège, États-Unis
- Sachs et Warner-Malédiction !
- Lederman et Maloney-pas si vite
 - Critiquer les RN de proxy et les valeurs aberrantes de Sachs et Warner
 - On a trouvé aucune aide concernant la malédiction des RN
 - Hypothèse alternative : structure commerciale, surendettement, institutions, etc.

Motivation (ii)

- Histoire de l'Amérique latine
 - Réussites
 - Chili, Venezuela (1920-1970)
 - Echecs
 - Venezuela (après les années 70), encore plus aujourd'hui
- Aucune malédiction également pour le développement humain
 - Pineda et Rodriguez (2011) ont trouvé un effet très positif des ressources naturelles sur HDI
 - En particulier ses dimensions autres que financières
- Cette recherche s'ajoute à l'analyse de l'équilibre des genres
 - Les changements dans les indicateurs de l'IDH et de genre tendent à être plus grands pour les pays à exportations nettes élevées de RN

Les pays à exportations nettes élevées de RN ont tendance à avoir de meilleures performances

Summary Statistics: Mean of variables

	Changes (1990-2012)		
	All countries	High Net Exporters	High Net Importers
HDI	0.004745 <i>142</i>	0.0042803 <i>21</i>	0.0044915 <i>16</i>
Adolescent fertility rate	-1.124101 <i>228</i>	-0.8414897 <i>23</i>	-0.4062512 <i>19</i>
School enrollment secondary (female)	0.9248055 <i>119</i>	0.5650904 <i>9</i>	0.5266916 <i>11</i>
Labor force participation (15-64, female/male)	0.2095296 <i>219</i>	0.3821475 <i>23</i>	0.497169 <i>19</i>
Maternal mortality ratio	-7.875157 <i>217</i>	-1.158103 <i>23</i>	-0.3295455 <i>16</i>
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments	0.4474824 <i>164</i>	0.509375 <i>16</i>	0.6128409 <i>16</i>
Gender Inequality Index*	-0.007199 <i>80</i>	-0.0086806 <i>12</i>	-0.004947 <i>11</i>

Note: High Net Exporters/Importers refers to countries that are exporting/importing more than the average exporter/importer.

* Changes for Gender Inequality Index if for 2000-2012, due to data availability.

Notre analyse (i)

- Données
 - Mandataire des ressources naturelles de Lederman et de Maloney
 - Exportations nettes de ressources naturelles par travailleur
 - Importations totales (pour contrôler le biais)
 - Données sur le développement humain du PNUD, BRDH
 - Indice d'inégalité de l'IDH et des genres
 - Indicateurs de genres de la Banque mondiale, WDI
 - Le taux de fécondité des adolescents, scolarisation dans le secondaire (femelle), la participation de la population active (15-64, femelle / mâle), le taux de mortalité maternelle et la proportion de sièges occupés par des femmes dans les parlements
 - Variables de contrôle transfrontalier
 - Clauses des chocs commerciaux et des institutions

Notre analyse (i)

- Période
1990-2012 pour tous les indicateurs, à l'exception de l'Indice d'inégalité des genres (2000-2012)
- Méthodologie
de regression de la croissance transfrontalière OLS
Coefficients bêta et contrôle pour les valeurs aberrantes
- Interactions des variables muettes régionales
Afin de vérifier tout effet différentiel des ressources naturelles entre les régions, en particulier parmi les pays d'Amérique latine

Les RN ont un effet positif sur l'IDH...

HDI change (1990-2012) OLS regression

Explanatory variables:	coeff.	coeff.	coeff.
Net Natural Resource Exports (pos NX/L)	0.000260** [0.000118]	0.00018 [0.000167]	0.00023 [0.000194]
Net Natural Resource Imports (neg NX/L)	-0.000399*** [0.000140]	-0.000371** [0.000143]	-0.000371** [0.000155]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Exporters (pos M/L)	0.00028 [0.000169]	0.000402** [0.000190]	0.00021 [0.000194]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Importers (neg M/L)	0.000817*** [0.000217]	0.000834*** [0.000237]	0.000877*** [0.000263]
ln HDI in 1990	-0.00645*** [0.00103]	-0.00650*** [0.000929]	-0.00700*** [0.000932]
Terms of Trade Growth		0.00271 [0.00653]	-0.00100 [0.00750]
Executive Constraint			0.00043 [0.000367]
Interaction Latin America and Net Natural Resources Exports	-0.00019 [0.000282]	-0.00007 [0.000299]	-0.00005 [0.000332]
Interaction Latin America and Total Imports of Net Natural Resources Exporters	-0.000412 [0.000311]	-0.00040 [0.000308]	-0.0000921 [0.000323]
<i>Sum of coefficients:</i>			
pos NX/L + pos M/L	0.00054	0.00058	0.00043
F test	10.70000	8.07000	3.36000
p value	0.00160	0.00580	0.07120
neg NX/L + neg M/L	0.000418	0.00046	0.00051
F test	4.21000	4.73000	4.52000
p value	0.04340	0.03290	0.03710
pos NX/L*LAC + pos M/L*LAC	-0.00060	-0.00046	-0.00015
F test	3.46000	2.07000	0.18000
p value	0.06650	0.15460	0.67390
Observations	95	89	84
R-squared	0.590	0.662	0.680

Robust normalized beta coefficients in brackets

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Notes: (1) Change refers to annual average change in the period 1990 - 2012; (2) Regional Dummies are included in all specifications.

... et sur l'équilibre entre les sexes

(i) ...

Adolescent fertility rate change (1990-2012) OLS regression

Explanatory variables:	coeff.	coeff.	coeff.
Net Natural Resource Exports (pos NX/L)	-0.0461 [0.0640]	-0.066 [0.0678]	-0.0669 [0.0589]
Net Natural Resource Imports (neg NX/L)	0.0392 [0.0693]	0.0348 [0.0681]	-0.00796 [0.0697]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Exporters (pos M/L)	-0.151** [0.0700]	-0.164** [0.0789]	-0.193** [0.0934]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Importers (neg M/L)	-0.210** [0.0906]	-0.299*** [0.0954]	-0.210** [0.0951]
In Adolescent fertility rate in 1990	-0.738*** [0.111]	-0.770*** [0.120]	-0.847*** [0.164]
Terms of Trade Growth		3.489 [2.240]	3.312 [2.481]
Executive Constraint			-0.00998 [0.228]
Interaction Latin America and Net Natural Resources Exports	0.0753 [0.128]	0.0987 [0.130]	0.143 [0.124]
Interaction Latin America and Total Imports of Net Natural Resources Exporters	-0.238* [0.141]	-0.128 [0.146]	0.0179 [0.158]
<i>Sum of coefficients:</i>			
pos NX/L + pos M/L	-0.19663	-0.23007	-0.26038
F test	6.09000	9.65000	10.59000
p value	0.01530	0.00260	0.00170
neg NX/L + neg M/L	-0.17032	-0.26429	-0.21751
F test	4.09000	7.92000	5.26000
p value	0.04580	0.00600	0.02470
pos NX/L*LAC + pos M/L*LAC	-0.16224	-0.02967	0.16046
F test	1.20000	0.03000	0.73000
p value	0.27530	0.85300	0.39630
Observations	114	102	91
R-squared	0.638	0.693	0.677

Robust normalized beta coefficients in brackets

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Notes: (1) Change refers to annual average change in the period 1990 - 2012; (2) Regional Dummies are included in all specifications.

... et sur l'équilibre entre les sexes

(ii)...

School enrollment secondary (female) change (1990-2012) OLS regression

Explanatory variables:	coeff.	coeff.	coeff.
Net Natural Resource Exports (pos NX/L)	-0.00345 [0.0917]	-0.028 [0.0661]	-0.0487 [0.0851]
Net Natural Resource Imports (neg NX/L)	-0.0911 [0.0748]	-0.0324 [0.0690]	-0.0327 [0.0791]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Exporters (pos M/L)	0.219* [0.122]	0.437*** [0.105]	0.352*** [0.121]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Importers (neg M/L)	0.143 [0.173]	0.380* [0.193]	0.269 [0.208]
In School enrollment secondary (female) in 1990	-0.0616 [0.203]	-0.365 [0.231]	-0.321 [0.266]
Terms of Trade Growth		8.803*** [2.095]	9.884*** [3.434]
Executive Constraint			0.564 [0.390]
Interaction Latin America and Net Natural Resources Exports	-0.369* [0.198]	-0.350*** [0.123]	-0.378*** [0.133]
Interaction Latin America and Total Imports of Net Natural Resources Exporters	-0.267 [0.189]	-0.14 [0.124]	0.0159 [0.199]
<i>Sum of coefficients:</i>			
pos NX/L + pos M/L	0.21508	0.38158	0.22617
F test	3.11000	15.62000	2.89000
p value	0.08580	0.00040	0.09970
neg NX/L + neg M/L	0.051477	0.33220	0.28669
F test	0.11000	3.74000	1.41000
p value	0.74540	0.06210	0.24530
pos NX/L*LAC + pos M/L*LAC	-0.63642	-0.35049	-0.23030
F test	8.85000	5.74000	1.07000
p value	0.00500	0.02260	0.30890
Observations	54	48	46
R-squared	0.615	0.748	0.748

Robust normalized beta coefficients in brackets

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Notes: (1) Change refers to annual average change in the period 1990 - 2012; (2) Regional Dummies are included in all specifications.

... et sur l'équilibre entre les sexes

(iii)...

Labor force participation (15-64, female/male) change (1990-2012) OLS regression

Explanatory variables:	coeff.	coeff.	coeff.
Net Natural Resource Exports (pos NX/L)	-0.000382** [0.000168]	-0.000326 [0.000210]	-0.000274 [0.000226]
Net Natural Resource Imports (neg NX/L)	0.000176 [0.000251]	0.000235 [0.000161]	0.000209 [0.000180]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Exporters (pos M/L)	0.00103*** [0.000338]	0.000998** [0.000382]	0.00112*** [0.000421]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Importers (neg M/L)	0.00133*** [0.000319]	0.00126*** [0.000301]	0.00137*** [0.000414]
In Labor force participation (15-64, female/male) in 1990	-0.00588*** [0.000805]	-0.00538*** [0.000947]	-0.00476*** [0.000909]
Terms of Trade Growth		0.014 [0.0135]	-0.000149 [0.0115]
Executive Constraint			-0.000222 [0.000872]
Interaction Latin America and Net Natural Resources Exports	0.00120* [0.000604]	0.00117* [0.000693]	0.00152** [0.000646]
Interaction Latin America and Total Imports of Net Natural Resources Exporters	-0.00223*** [0.000767]	-0.00174** [0.000834]	-0.00182** [0.000911]
<i>Sum of coefficients:</i>			
pos NX/L + pos M/L	0.00065	0.00067	0.00084
F test	7.85000	6.36000	8.74000
p value	0.00610	0.01340	0.00420
neg NX/L + neg M/L	0.001510	0.00149	0.00157
F test	32.57000	27.59000	20.42000
p value	0.00000	0.00000	0.00000
pos NX/L*LAC + pos M/L*LAC	-0.00104	-0.00057	-0.00031
F test	1.72000	0.46000	0.13000
p value	0.19280	0.49730	0.72070
Observations	118	105	92
R-squared	0.660	0.679	0.707

Robust normalized beta coefficients in brackets

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Notes: (1) Change refers to annual average change in the period 1990 - 2012; (2) Regional Dummies are included in all specifications.

... mais négatif dans d'autres dimensions

(i)...

Maternal mortality ratio change (1990-2012) OLS regression

Explanatory variables:	coeff.	coeff.	coeff.
Net Natural Resource Exports (pos NX/L)	0.927*** [0.298]	0.810** [0.399]	0.884** [0.432]
Net Natural Resource Imports (neg NX/L)	0.471* [0.251]	0.458* [0.257]	0.253 [0.290]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Exporters (pos M/L)	0.862** [0.381]	0.635 [0.425]	0.459 [0.499]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Importers (neg M/L)	0.249 [0.340]	0.332 [0.387]	0.446 [0.525]
ln Maternal mortality ratio in 1990	-2.460*** [0.510]	-2.621*** [0.524]	-3.380*** [0.587]
Terms of Trade Growth		16.48* [9.408]	22.05** [10.91]
Executive Constraint			-0.473 [1.260]
Interaction Latin America and Net Natural Resources Exports	-0.189 [0.679]	-0.152 [0.695]	-0.481 [0.676]
Interaction Latin America and Total Imports of Net Natural Resources Exporters	-0.145 [1.199]	0.234 [1.191]	0.156 [1.147]
<i>Sum of coefficients:</i>			
pos NX/L + pos M/L	1.78923	1.44534	1.34377
F test	17.77000	8.36000	5.24000
p value	0.00010	0.00480	0.02470
neg NX/L + neg M/L	0.719528	0.78923	0.69891
F test	4.24000	4.03000	2.14000
p value	0.04190	0.04770	0.14750
pos NX/L*LAC + pos M/L*LAC	-0.33358	0.08149	-0.32477
F test	0.14000	0.01000	0.11000
p value	0.70960	0.93250	0.74250
Observations	118	109	97
R-squared	0.819	0.798	0.79

Robust normalized beta coefficients in brackets

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Notes: (1) Change refers to annual average change in the period 1990 - 2012; (2) Regional Dummies are included in all specifications.

... mais négatif dans d'autres dimensions

(ii)...

Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments (1990-2012) OLS regression

Explanatory variables:	coeff.	coeff.	coeff.
Net Natural Resource Exports (pos NX/L)	-0.0361 [0.0559]	-0.0164 [0.0563]	-0.00675 [0.0528]
Net Natural Resource Imports (neg NX/L)	-0.130* [0.0722]	-0.0482 [0.0553]	-0.109 [0.0704]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Exporters (pos M/L)	-0.015 [0.0632]	0.0066 [0.0599]	-0.0336 [0.0857]
Total Imports of Net Natural Resource Importers (neg M/L)	0.0534 [0.0879]	-0.0362 [0.0895]	0.118 [0.135]
In Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments in 1990	-0.113 [0.0721]	-0.195*** [0.0687]	-0.073 [0.0714]
Terms of Trade Growth		-2.925 [3.222]	-4.83 [3.087]
Executive Constraint			0.548** [0.222]
Interaction Latin America and Net Natural Resources Exports	0.111 [0.135]	0.119 [0.123]	0.129 [0.129]
Interaction Latin America and Total Imports of Net Natural Resources Exporters	-0.186 [0.158]	-0.175 [0.159]	-0.0599 [0.192]
<i>Sum of coefficients:</i>			
pos NX/L + pos M/L	-0.05103	-0.00983	-0.04032
F test	0.73000	0.03000	0.29000
p value	0.39730	0.87300	0.59460
neg NX/L + neg M/L	-0.076366	-0.08433	0.00870
F test	1.23000	1.43000	0.01000
p value	0.27230	0.23580	0.93730
pos NX/L*LAC + pos M/L*LAC	-0.07529	-0.05646	0.06928
F test	0.38000	0.15000	0.14000
p value	0.53800	0.69770	0.71280
Observations	81	78	67
R-squared	0.370	0.376	0.430

Robust normalized beta coefficients in brackets

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Notes: (1) Change refers to annual average change in the period 1990 - 2012; (2) Regional Dummies are included in all specifications.

Conclusions (i)

- Nous avons trouvé des preuves contre une malédiction des ressources naturelles sur le développement humain et l'équilibre entre les sexes
- Pour la plupart des indicateurs, le principal élément est l'effet composé de l'abondance des RN
 - L'effet a tendance à être plus grand pour les exportateurs nets
- Les résultats sont négatifs ou non significatifs pour certaines dimensions importantes
 - La mortalité maternelle et des femmes dans les parlements

Conclusions (ii)

- Les résultats sont négatifs ou non significatifs pour les pays d'Amérique latine.

En particulier, l>IDH et l'inscription au secondaire (femelle)

Comme dans le cas de Pineda et Rodriguez (2011)

- Recherches futures

Se focaliser sur la compréhension différents mécanismes de transmission (par exemple, les allocations budgétaires, la participation politique) Utiliser des indicateurs multidimensionnels de l'équilibre entre les sexes (disponibilité limitée des données)



DEVTECH

Malédiction ou bénédiction ? Ressources naturelles, développement humain et genre

Rafael Romeu

Systèmes DevTech

rromeu@devtechsys.com

José Pineda

Université de la Colombie-Britannique

jose.pineda@sauder.ubc.ca